

Johnny Wei-Bing Lin

University of Washington Bothell and North Park University

January 11, 2018



You're working to move forward the formulation of land- and water-use policy for the city. When all the stakeholders meet together, each party seems to advocate a different response to the challenges the city faces. Is there an analytical framework to help us understand these differing responses and facilitate dialogue?

How to Really Understand What Is Good Environmental Stewardship

Criteria for Evaluation:

- Importance
- Goals
- Practice



Determinants of Criteria:

- Worldview
- Ethical Theories
- Science Epistemology
- Science-Policy
- Politics
- Economics



Reason, revelation, intuition, etc.

Figuring Out Why People Hold the Views They Do About Science and Policy

Criteria for Evaluation:

- Importance
- Goals
- Practice

What nature is + How science knows:

- What science can say about nature
- What science-policy models to use

Determinants of Criteria:

- Worldview
- Ethical Theories
- Science Epistemology
- Science-Policy
- Politics
- Economics



Reason, revelation, intuition, etc.

Figuring Out Why People Prefer Certain Practices

Criteria for Evaluation:

- Importance
- Goals
- Practice

- The range of responses possible?
- How values enter into our choices of responses?
- How can this information support dialogue?

Determinants of Criteria:

- Worldview
- Ethical Theories
- Science Epistemology
- Science-Policy
- Politics
- Economics



Reason, revelation, intuition, etc.



A Schema For Problems

 $A \longrightarrow B$

Action or activity

Undesirable consequence

The Range of Responses to Problems

 $A \longrightarrow B$

Action or activity

Undesirable consequence

- Do nothing
- Eliminate A: $* \rightarrow B$
- Eliminate the connection: $A \Rightarrow B$
- Isolate the harmful effects: $A \rightarrow (B)$

A Non-Environmental Example of the Range of Responses

$$A \longrightarrow B$$

Motor vehicle accidents

Act of killing

Death

- Do nothing
- Decrease and/or eliminate motor vehicle accidents: DUI laws, self-driving cars, etc.
- Prevent motor vehicle accidents from killing people: Seatbelt laws, air bags, etc.
- Make death less undesirable: Laws to mandate liability insurance, etc.

An Environmental Example of the Range of Responses

CO₂ emissions

 $A \longrightarrow B$ Greenhouse

effect, etc.

More extreme weather, pestilence, etc.

- Do nothing
- Decrease CO₂ emissions: Renewable energy sources, increase conservation, air capture, etc.
- Disrupt connection between CO₂ emissions and harms:
 Orbiting parasol at Lagrange point between Sun and Earth.
- Avoid harms: Stricter zoning in floodplains, higher sea walls, etc.



Evaluating Various Responses

- Is it possible to eliminate *A*? At what cost?
- Will eliminating *A* result in side-effects? Are they desirable or undesirable?
- Is it possible to eliminate the connection between *A* and *B*? At what cost?
- Will putting a "hedge" around *B* result in other side-effects? How desirable or undesirable are they?
- Are the undesirable effects of *B* undesirable enough to justify action? Of what kind?
- Note: "Costs" and "benefits" are not only monetary but may be spiritual, moral, cultural, mental, etc.

Checklist of Eight Places Values Enter Into the Evaluation of Responses

The nature and value of <i>A</i> .
The nature and value of <i>B</i> .
The nature and value of "→".
Value of doing nothing.
Value of eliminating <i>A</i> .
Value of eliminating "→".
Value of isolating harmful effects of <i>B</i> .
How we weigh and compare actions and their effects (e.g., anthropocentric consequentialist vs. Romantic deontologist).

How This Structure Can Help Support Dialogue

- Don't prematurely restrict range of responses to consider.
- Non-obvious solutions may be ground for compromise.
- Identify values used in the evaluation of responses: find common ground and build trust around those.

Determinants of Criteria:

- Worldview
- Ethical Theories
- Science Epistemology
- Science-Policy
- Politics
- Economics

Getting a Handle on the Breadth of Complex Motivations

The Nature of Environmental Stewardship (Pickwick Publications, 2016)

http://nature.johnny-lin.com

- Sample chapter on website
- Amazon: Print, Kindle

